

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF INGHAM

ROBBIE FLOWERS, MICHAEL WELLS  
and JANET WHITSON,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

There is no other pending or resolved civil action arising out of the same transaction or occurrence as alleged in the complaint.

Case No. CZ  
Hon.

RICK SNYDER, as the Governor of the State  
of Michigan; ANDY DILLON, as the Treasurer of  
the State of Michigan; and the STATE OF MICHIGAN;

Defendants.

---

William A. Wertheimer (P26275)  
Attorney for plaintiffs  
30515 Timberbrook Lane  
Bingham Farms, MI 48025  
248-644-9200  
[billwertheimer@gmail.com](mailto:billwertheimer@gmail.com)

Andrew Nickeloff (P37990)  
Marshall J. Widick (P53942)  
James A. Britton (P71157)  
Attorneys for plaintiffs  
Sachs Waldman  
1000 Farmer  
Detroit, MI 48226  
313-496-9429  
[anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com](mailto:anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com)  
[mwidick@sachswaldman.com](mailto:mwidick@sachswaldman.com)  
[jabritton@sachswaldman.com](mailto:jabritton@sachswaldman.com)

**VERIFIED COMPLAINT**

Plaintiffs, by their attorneys, state:

**I. NATURE OF PLAINTIFFS' CLAIMS**

1. Plaintiffs are two City of Detroit retirees currently receiving pension benefits and a City of Detroit employee with vested pension benefits whose rights are being violated in the emergency financial management proceedings that the State has implemented in response to Detroit's fiscal crisis and whose rights will be threatened with abrogation if Governor Snyder authorizes the Detroit Emergency Manager to proceed under Chapter 9 in bankruptcy.

2. This action is brought for violations of plaintiffs' constitutional rights under Article 9, Section 24 of the Michigan Constitution which provides: "The accrued financial benefits of each pension plan and retirement system of the state and its political subdivisions shall be a contractual obligation whereof which shall not be diminished or impaired thereby."

3. The *Local Financial Stability and Choice Act*, Public Act 436 of 2012, MCL 141.1541, *et seq.* (Public Act 436) permits Governor Snyder to authorize a Chapter 9 bankruptcy. MCL 141.1558. A copy of Public Act 436 is available at [www.legislature.mi.gov](http://www.legislature.mi.gov).

4. The Detroit Emergency Manager has, as part of his restructuring planning, publicly announced that he intends to significantly cut vested pension amounts of the city's retirees and employees in violation of Article 9, Section 24 and threatened to seek to extinguish their Article 9, Section 24 rights in bankruptcy if they fail to agree which they have not.

5. Plaintiffs seek an order precluding Governor Snyder or the State Treasurer from authorizing Detroit's Emergency Manager to proceed under Chapter 9 of the federal Bankruptcy Code because to do so would threaten to abrogate their rights under Article 9, Section 24 of the Michigan Constitution.

## **II. JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

6. This Court has jurisdiction under MCL 600.6419(4) (proceedings for declaratory or equitable relief against state) and 600.605 (original jurisdiction of circuit courts).

7. Venue is proper in Ingham County pursuant to MCL 600.1615 (actions against

governmental units) and MCL 600.1621 (county in which a defendant conducts business).

### **III. PARTIES**

8. Plaintiff Robbie Flowers resides at 6533 East Jefferson, Apt. 602T, Detroit, Michigan. She is a citizen of the State of Michigan, and an employee of the Detroit Library Commission with a right to vested pension benefits from Detroit's General Retirement System (GRS).

9. Plaintiff Michael Wells resides at 100 Atkinson, Detroit, Michigan. He is a citizen of the State of Michigan, and a retiree from the Detroit Library Commission receiving a pension from Detroit's GRS.

10. Plaintiff Janet Whitson resides at 25260 East Deborah, Redford, Michigan. She is a citizen of the State of Michigan, and a retiree from the Detroit Library Commission receiving a pension from Detroit's GRS.

11. Defendant Rick Snyder is the Governor of the State of Michigan and is sued in that capacity.

12. The Detroit Emergency Manager serves at the pleasure of the Governor. MCL 141.1549(3)(d).

13. Defendant Andy Dillon is the Treasurer of the State of Michigan and is sued in that capacity.

14. The Governor may delegate to the State Treasurer his duties under MCL 141.1549.

15. The Emergency Manager submits quarterly reports to the State Treasurer. MCL 141.1549(8) and 141.1549(5).

16. Defendant State of Michigan is the governmental entity on behalf of which the Governor and State Treasurer are acting.

**IV. IT WOULD BE UNCONSTITUTIONAL FOR THE GOVERNOR TO AUTHORIZE THE DETROIT EMERGENCY MANAGER TO PROCEED UNDER CHAPTER 9**

17. The Detroit Emergency Manager is acting pursuant to Public Act 436.

18. Public Act 436 provides that the Governor can authorize the Emergency Manager to proceed under chapter 9 of the Federal Bankruptcy Code. MCR 141.1558.

19. On 14 June 2013 the Detroit Emergency Manager issued an “Executive Summary” of a “Proposal for Creditors,” which stated under “Claims for Unfunded Pension Liabilities”: “Because the amounts realized on the underfunding claims will be substantially less than the underfunding amount, there must be **significant** cuts, in accrued, vested pension amounts for **both active and currently retired persons.**” (Emphasis in original.) A copy of this document is available at [www.detroitmi.gov](http://www.detroitmi.gov) under the “Emergency Manager” tab.

20. The same day the Detroit Emergency Manager released this “Executive Summary” he spoke to the Detroit Free Press Editorial Board. The relevant questions and answers read as follows:

Q. You said in this report that you don’t believe there is an obligation under our state constitution to pay pensions if the city can’t afford it?

A. The reason we said it that way is to quantify the bankruptcy question. We think federal supremacy trumps state law.

Q. Which the Ninth Circuit agrees for now.

A. It is what it is – so we said that in a soft way of saying, “Don’t make us go into bankruptcy.” **If you think your state-vested pension rights, either as an employee or a retiree – that’s not going to protect you. If we don’t reach an agreement one way or the other, we feel fairly confident that the state federal law, federalism, will trump state law or negotiate.** The irony of the situation is we might reach a deal with creditors quicker because employees and retirees think there is some benefit and that might force our hand. That might force a bankruptcy.

(Emphasis added.) The interview is available at [www.freep.com/article/20130616OPINION](http://www.freep.com/article/20130616OPINION).

21. At no place in this “Executive Summary” or anyplace else has the Detroit Emergency Manager (or Defendants Snyder or Dillon) stated that he is bound by or in any way

intends to recognize the applicability of Article 9, Section 24 of the Michigan Constitution.

22. It is clear from the above recitation of facts that unless plaintiffs and other City of Detroit retirees and employees with vested pension benefits accede to the threats of the Detroit Emergency Manager he will recommend to the Governor and the State Treasurer that the City of Detroit be authorized to proceed under Chapter 9. MCL 141.1558.

23. It is also clear from the above recitation of facts that if the Governor and/or the State Treasurer authorize a Chapter 9 filing the Detroit Emergency Manager will not uphold but rather seek to abrogate the rights of plaintiffs and others to their accrued pension benefits in violation of Article 9, Section 24 of the Michigan Constitution.

24. If the Governor and the State Treasurer are not enjoined from authorizing a Chapter 9 filing, plaintiffs will be irreparably harmed.

25. The harm to plaintiffs absent injunctive relief outweighs the harm an injunction would cause defendants.

26. Plaintiffs are likely to succeed on the merits.

27. There will be harm to the public interest if an injunction is not issued, as thousands of City of Detroit retirees and employees will be threatened with the loss of their constitutional rights to their vested pensions.

## **VI. RELIEF**

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs respectfully request that this Honorable Court issue:

A. an injunction precluding the Governor or the State Treasurer from authorizing the Detroit Emergency Manager to commence proceedings under Chapter 9 of the federal Bankruptcy Code;

B. appropriate declaratory relief;

C. such other relief in the form of injunctions, writs or orders, as this Court deems just



Subscribed and sworn to before me this 3rd day of July 2013.

Karen Purslow, Notary Public  
County of Oakland, State of Michigan  
My Commission Expires: \_\_\_\_\_